An (In)Equitable Transition

Event transcript

- Great to see everyone here. My name is Alec Tang and I'll be facilitating the conversation, the korero this evening around an inequitable transition where to from here. Welcome conversations is providing this opportunity to inspire and stimulate our thinking about these challenges that face Tamaki Makaurau. And tonight, what we want to do is explore this concept of equity, equity challenges, that many at that leading edge of climate action are seeking. We want to talk about the lessons we have learned or need to learn from our recent experiences of society shaping disruption. So, thanks for joining us tonight. Thank you for those of you who've made the trip down here to Manukau. This is a departure from usual conversations and I thought a really important departure to move out from the central city. Thank you also for those of you joining online. I know that there was quite a sign of an interest in here, so I'm thinking there's lots of you tuning in from home or wherever you are. And also welcome to those who are watching this recording. The event is being co-sponsored by KPMG New Zealand and the Institute of Environmental Management and Assessment, many of whom are based in other parts of the world. So, kia ora welcome to the recording if you're tuning in lately. Just a couple of bits of housekeeping before we kind of truck on. The bathrooms, if you haven't found them, at the top of the stairs to the left hand side, just near where you came into the kind of the communal area. In the unlikely event of an emergency, you'll hear an alarm and there are emergency exits down here at the bottom front of the stage, as well as at the top back of the stage. The meet point is Hamann Park and you will find Hamann Park 'cause it's got a lovely new playground. So, congregate over at Hamann Park. I would probably suggest you don't try out all the swings and the roundabouts and the slides until we know that everyone is safe and secure. Just for context, those of you who did come by train, the trains carry on through the evening, but the last direct train into the central city leaves at about quarter past seven. So, that will take you straight back into Britomart. There are trains after quarter past seven, but they require a transfer on the southern line, either Otahuhu or if you haven't been there, go check out the Puhinui Station. That's a really nice building to go and have a look around as you wait for your connection. We are going to aim to be closed up around 7, 7:30, something along those lines. So if you do need to make that 7:15 train, then obviously just head out and as quietly as you can. Finally, if you could please turn all mobiles to silent, but leave them on so that you can post on social media and I'll come back to that in a second. And/or we'll be using Slido to field the questions. And I'll expand a little bit more about Slido in a second. But before we go into more details about tonight, about this evening, I'd like to invite Johnnie Freeland Ngaati Te Ata Waiohua who are the Iwi Host partners for the Auckland Climate Festival to open with some words and a karakia.

- Good eve, everybody. As Alec introduced me, my name's Johnnie Freeland. I'm wearing a number of hats tonight, but certainly the one of the most important ones is just as the one of our Iwi representatives of Ngaati Te Ata, who are our co-host for the Auckland Climate

Festival this year. And just over a week ago, we had our launch, our dawn launch up at the near the headquarters of the Puhinui Stream, which is up in the botanical gardens and just acknowledging the mahi that's happening within the Puhinui. I think there's up to 30 groups now, agencies and community groups, that are working together around the regeneration of the wellbeing of the stream and its peoples. And it's only a 12.6 kilometre stream, but it's got two motorways that cut across it in a railway line. We have the most pristine part of our catchment up in the upper, catchment around the botanical gardens. And then, we follow the concrete to the harbour. And we've got a middle bit that's sort of a mixture of social housing, kind water housing, commercial, the Manukau City, the town centre, and then the third of the catchment when you get past that Highway 20, we also happen to have our two ancestral maunga there. One's literally a hole in the ground now, that was quarried and almost looks like a step pyramid, but two thirds of it was quarried. And so, that's our contribution to the motorway and a lot of the main trunk line in terms of the use of the scoria But nevertheless, it represents our whakapapa and it's a good indicator in our belief system that the state of our people reflect the state of the environment And certainly in terms of climate change, the opportunity to come together to talk about an equitable or inequitable transition. Certainly, from our experience as Iwi, but also people of South Auckland. I think there's an important contribution that we can make to that conversation.

- Thanks, Johnnie and I appreciate you opening us up and also being part of the panel discussion later on. As Johnnie highlighted, this event, whilst being an Auckland Conversations event is also part of a wider movement for Auckland as around climate. Really proud that this event is being hosted as part of the Auckland Climate Festival, which is a citywide month of climate actions and activations. By being here, you're part of that Auckland Climate Festival Whānau I know I can see a few of you have been to a number of events and are hosting events, which is fantastic to see. And a key part of that is to try and inspire and highlight that actually whilst when we think about climate action, climate change, often we feel like we're acting in isolation or that there's not enough happening, which that isn't enough happening. But that's not to say that there isn't anything happening. So, that's a really important part of why we are here for this korero or for this conversation. As Johnnie kind of alluded to, this year's festival theme is , which encouraged us to think and to consider about our relationship with the natural world with water, with and how we can use that to strengthen our climate response. Please check out the Auckland Climate Festival programme. We are, as Johnnie highlighted, just one and a bit months, one and a bit weeks, sorry, into the month. So, there's plenty more to get to get involved in if you go to aucklandclimatefestival.co.nz. So today's events actually is part of that climate festival, have sought to look at Maramataka, Maori lunar calendar as well. And you'll be interested to know that today is lunar phase is , which lends itself towards community-based activities, by the sea, drawing on the . So, we're not too far away from the sea. So, the other thing to note is that our catchment that we own and around and each of the Auckland Climate Festival events have looked at catchments as Manukau Harbour catchment. So, we'd like to acknowledge the communities of this catchment, as well as the waterways that traversed through. So, tonight what we're going to do is the format for this evening's proceedings is the first thing, is that we're going to have David Hall, a climate policy director at Toha to talk through a few of his reflections. So those of you who don't know David, he brought together a really interesting series of essays called "Careful Revolution," towards a low emissions

future. And that was back in 2019, pre-COVID. And so, David's going to talk to us a little bit about his reflections from that point, what he's seen in terms of this concept of a just transition and maybe some lessons and observations and so on. After David's had a little korero with you all, I'll invite the rest of the panellists to come along and I'll introduce them later. And we'll have a bit of a discussion and we'll have a Q&A where you, the audience and those of you online, have the opportunity to pose your questions to the speakers. We do have a limited amount of time, so please, if you do have a question, keep them to the point. And if you'd like to direct them to a specific member of the panel, then please kind of highlight that in your question. We will be using Slido. Those of you haven't used Slido, I think there's a slide up there to highlight. It's an interactive Q&A tool. If you go to slido.com, using whatever tablet device that you have into the event code, which is #equity, and you'll find our series of questions or platform to provide those questions. If you can't make that work or if you are having trouble connecting, then one of the team here, if you want to give a wave, has a tablet, has a device. That if you're having trouble, just pop your hand up and she'll come and help and we can get your questions lodged that way. Last couple of things before I open up and provide the conch. I was thinking about the conch to David. You are welcome to tweet during the event and encouraged to engage on social media. Use that #AucklandConversation or AKLConversations, or ClimateAction, or ACF23 to tag your posts, whichever platform you're choosing to use these days. We are always trying to ensure that the Auckland Conversations Event is inclusive and accessible. So an on demand viewing of the event, with a full transcript and captioning of the event, will be available on that Auckland Conversations website in the next few days. So with that, just a couple of couple of comments to set the scene and without belabouring it, you know, we know that this concept of an equitable transition has been front and centre as we've developed our climate responses both locally and globally. It's a key consideration within Te Taruke-a-Tawhiri Auckland's climate plan, which Johnnie, myself, David, actually a number of us in this room, fundamentally have helped to shape. And within that plan, there's a quote that says, "Climate change is not only an environmental issue. It is also a deeply social issue with significant implications for those that are most vulnerable." Also goes on to say that, "Climate change also creates intergenerational inequity. If we do not act, we risk leaving a significantly different and less habitable world to our children and our children's children." So, that's the sentiment that underpins us coming here today. A similar sentiment is present in our national response as well as our international commitments. So, we know that those impacts climate change are going to more adversely affect those that are least able to respond, the most vulnerable parts of our communities. We've seen in recent years, whether that's COVID, whether it's through the floods of Auckland Anniversary Day, whether it's the events of cyclones at Gabriel that we cannot navigate through either the short-term shocks or those long-term shifts as individuals. We need to build resilience and connectivity across all parts of our community. But to do that, we need to place a really sharp focus on the inequities that may be exacerbated both by climate change, as well as our response to climate change. So, how do we do this? How do we make sure that we are recognising those inequities? How do we build a more equitable response as a focus of this evening? And I'm really pleased to have a fantastic panel to bring their diverse experience of equity and climate change to the discussion. So to kick us off, I'd love to invite David Hall to the stage, as I said, currently climate policy director at Toha, but has a wealth of experience in this space. So David, over to you.

- Thank you. Tena kotou, tena kotou, tena tatou katoa. Thanks all for coming out this evening. Nga mihi kia kotou. And thanks Alec for the, for your introduction and this invitation to offer some reflections on just and equitable transitions, which as Alec said, was the theme of this book that I pulled together five years ago, "A Careful Revolution." Only five years ago, but it feels like a very different time. I'm probably going to make us all feel a little bit older by recounting some of the things that were happening five years ago. It was almost exactly five years ago in August, 2018 when Greta Thunberg, then an unknown 15 year old, started protesting outside of the Riksdag, the Swedish parliament. She and the school strikes for climate only came into global public consciousness as we were preparing the final proofs for the book. So, I just managed to sneak her in to provide an epigram for the book. And it wasn't the only sign that things were starting to change and to develop momentum, New momentum, I mean, obviously the, you know, climate action and the climate issue has been around for decades, but this was a time where new things were happening. And also in October, 2018, the IPCC, it published its special report on 1.5 degrees of warming and the impacts of that, which reinforced to even those of us who knew the risks, how significant those risks could be from even slight slivers of temperature change. And that same month, catalysed by that report, Extinction Rebellion began their first major public actions. And one month later, the des gilets jaunes or the yellow jacket protests kicked off in France. In November, 2018, a protest against the carbon tax that many felt was inequitable and unjust, which weighed heavier on some people than others. So, it started off as a resistance to climate change policy, but then eventually evolved into a more significant revolt against the French state. I was in a rush to get the proofs to the publisher before February 9th, 2019 because I had a second baby, Jo. I needed to clear the decks. She was born and a few weeks later, an eco-fascist terrorist shot 91 people in my hometown of Otautahi, killing 51 and posting a manifesto that justified his unjustifiable actions, partly on environmental grounds, on the same sorts of arguments that I've been making. Some of you might also remember that that atrocity happened on the first school strikes for climate protests in Aotearoa, which I attended with my firstborn, who was two the time we were doing a little daycare strikes for climate. And that was just a brutal, you know, unthinkable ending to a day that started with a unique sense of global interconnectivity, of intergenerational solidarity, and of hope. And one year after that, the country and most of the rest of the world went into shutdown in response to a highly contagious coronavirus, whose transmission to humans was made much more likely by climate change and by land use change. So, I'm sure I wasn't alone in feeling that history was speeding up at that time. That these were the messy signals of a transition, dare I say, a revolution, that was starting to gather momentum and traction and pace. The epigram that I mentioned from Greta Thunberg was this, "We have come here to let you know that change is coming, whether you like it or not." So how right she was. And in our book, we were focused on the human side of the climate crisis, on the human, also human reasons that this transition is so slow coming, the reasons why our governments and our markets have under responded, under-reacted, to the threat of climate change. And conventionally, climate change has been framed as a scientific problem, where the relevant expertise sits with scientists. But the issue of climate action, and especially climate in the action, is fundamentally, as Alec said, a social problem, where the relevant expertise sits with many others too, with social scientists for a start, but also with inventors and investors, with technologists and activists, with storytellers and knowledge holders, embedded in particular communities and cultures. Basically, the people who know something about the human condition and human potential. So, that's why I ended up with the contributors I

ended up with, which included a Maori political scientist, a Fijian lawyer, a Pakeha youth activist, a Hawaiian futurist, a trade unionist, the CEO of the then new CEO of NZ Superfund, who's just about to depart that role and a handful of climate experts. And the subject really was the dilemma that laid before us, a dilemma that sheds a little light on why progress on climate change has been so hard and so fractious. On the one hand, climate change is going to be hugely, terribly disruptive. As we've seen in Tamaki Makaurau this year, places that were once inhabitable are going to become uninhabitable or unsafe to live in. Economic activities that were once viable will cease to be so. And traditions and ways of life that have survived for centuries or millennia will become harder and harder to hold onto, be very disruptive indeed. But on the other hand, climate action will also be very disruptive. Climate action also requires us to change our ways to transform our economies, our institutions, our cityscapes, and our landscapes. Climate action, just like climate change, involves transformative change. Indeed, a revolution on the scale unseen since the industrial revolution or maybe the agricultural revolution before it. And so this is our dilemma, a choice between two forms of disruption, one proactive and one reactive. On the one hand, we can set out to control climate change by deliberately transforming our societies and our economies. On the other hand, we can recklessly expose ourselves to uncontrolled climate change, which will transform our societies anyway in abrupt, disorderly and unpredictable ways. Now of course, when I present our choice like this, it isn't much of a choice at all. It's easy to know what we ought to do. And actually, most people know what we ought to do. We can't avoid disruption entirely. We can't avoid change. We cannot put our hands in the sand and hope for the crisis to pass without tough decisions being made. So, we may as well be proactive. We might as well embrace the disruption of climate action, which at least allows us to exercise our human agency, our , our capacity to shape our future. The burdens of climate action are much more attractive in that sense than the burdens of climate change. However, we cannot understand our underreaction to climate change unless we understand that climate action does have burdens and that those burdens do not fall equally on everyone. Of course, it's sometimes okay that these burdens fall unevenly on some people, especially when those burdens fall upon the people who profit most from climate change and climate disruption. In 2022, the big Western oil and gas companies more than doubled their profits to $219 billion. $219 billion in a year. And some of those profits are already been redirected into new oil and gas exploration, even while international energy agency has confirmed that we cannot afford to expand production. Knowing what we know that this is a crime against humanity and we need to overturn the system, but the system will not turn over easily. That people who benefit most from fossil fuels have a lot to lose, which is why they've successfully opposed climate action for so long, spending billions on political influence and disinformation. Still this is a disruption that we should be uncompromising about. But if stopping climate change was this simple, then we'd have made much more progress than we have. The deeper problem is that disruption of climate action will go much deeper and wider than this. It will touch most, if not all of us, in some way or another. We'll all have to give up on some things. We'll have to change the way that we do some things. We'll have to pay more for some things. We'll have to transition into systems that won't always work as well as the systems we're leaving behind. That won't always be a source of regret. I don't think we still talk enough about the upsides of climate action, the cleaner, cheaper energy, the reductions in air pollution and waste, the opportunity to address challenges like cost of living and energy poverty. And in that vein, climate action can be really exciting, and gratifying, and empowering, and liberating. But change, especially

transformative change, is hard. And it can also be inconvenient, disadvantageous, risky, inhibiting, even debilitating. We live in a city that was built for cars. And so, any policy that makes driving more difficult or more expensive is going to affect our lives in really intimate ways. It's going to affect our livelihoods, our recreational opportunities, our social connectivity, our ability to get across town cheaply to visit our loved ones. So, it isn't just oil and gas tycoons that push back against climate action, it's also ordinary people. And while governments ought to be more robust in their confrontations with fossil fuels and other emitting sectors, there are limits to the ability of governments, especially democratic governments, to override the resistance of ordinary people. I mentioned the des gilets jaunes in France revolting against a fuel tax, but we've had this in New Zealand too and we've seen our government back away from taxes on fuels, emissions pricing and so on. We've also seen the emergence of Groundswell New Zealand, a group that didn't exist when we wrote the book, but which filled Queen Street with tractors and SUVs in 2021 to fight back against climate change policy. Of course, it's farmers who'll be most exposed to the droughts that we're going to have over the next few summers as we flip from La Nina, which brings the rain to El Nino, which brings the drought. And people don't only resist climate action because it's inconvenient and it interferes with their self-interests. Climate action, especially when it's poorly planned or poorly executed, can also be unfair or unjust. This isn't inevitable, but it is all too common. And that's why we talk about just transitions because this helps climate action to avoid exacerbating existing inequalities and vulnerabilities. In her chapter to the book, Maria Barge talks about a ticker transition, like a just transition, but a transition that is guided by Tikanga, by Te Tiriti, and international obligations under UNDRIP, the UN Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples. And she points out that if the crown does not take these seriously, then the transition to net zero will simply reproduce the injustices that occurred through colonisation, another type of transition which Maori have already been through. So like climate change, climate action can affect us each in different ways to different degrees depending on our circumstances, on our income, where we live, depending on our history, our identity, our values and priorities, our status in the eyes of others. And if climate policy is insensitive to these differences, if it's careless in this regard, then it can reproduce injustices and it can reproduce the worst aspects of the old economy in the new economy. And then, it'll create a backlash among the people who support it needs the most. And that's why the book was called "A Careful Revolution." You know, this will be a revolution one way or another. It's going to be disruptive. So, we cannot afford it to be careless or uncaring. If we face resistance from ordinary people, then we will never get anywhere. We need our decision makers to be careful to think about the policy, how policies affect people to reconsider policy mixes as they learn about their impacts. And we also as a society need to be caring to hold our communities together in spite of the disruption to help others when their lives and livelihoods are affected by climate change or the race to stop climate change. And actually, it might sound crazy, but especially in light of the extreme weather events of this year, but I actually feel more confident than ever that we will make the transition. It'll definitely be partly reactive to climate change, because decision makers have left things too late already. But it is becoming increasingly proactive. We can phase out emissions. And I say this with much greater confidence than I would've five years ago. We already know most of what we need to know to get most of the way to net zero. We have the technologies. They're getting cheaper. We have a greater sense of collective urgency. We have the power in our hands as consumers and voters to make different choices. It's simply a matter of turning this all into action and as we act, taking care of others. So to finish a quote

from the book, "A transition that takes care of people along the way would be the most rapid and enduring of all transitions, because it will bring people along with it, reduce the likelihood of revolt and resistance, and create the popular legitimacy that will sustain its reforms into the future.

- David, that's a fantastic way to open. I'd invite you to take a seat. And just as you do that, I think a few things just top of mind before I introduce the rest of the panel. One, I think right at the start, you reflected back five years ago. I think it's always really important, the prospect of where we need to go is always quite challenging and how much change we need to see. But just even a few of the things that you talked about five years ago that I'd actually forgotten, I'd forgotten about the global climate strikes. I remember I was there as well, feeling that euphoria, and then just a sudden bash down as we found out what was going on in another part of the country. So, we need to think about, well that was pre-COVID a whole different world. That was just five years ago. The potential that we could change in future for good if it's intentional and positive is fantastic. That other other element of two forms of disruption, you know, I think we'll think about as we go through. And then, I love the positivity at the end, which is really important. So as we kind of do a bit of a shuffle, I'd love to invite my panellists onto the stage. And to introduce some, Johnnie Freeland, who you've met. Councillor Josephine Bartley. So, we talked a little bit about decision making, Josephine, I wonder whether some of those questions will head your direction. So Josephine is councillor for Maungakiekie Tamaki Ward, my ward, which is great to have her here tonight. Corbin Whanga, who's an executive board member of OraTaiao New Zealand's Climate and Health Council. And Faiesea Ah Chee, the Pacific climate warrior and activists and all around everywhere doing wonderful things. We also had Jill Kwan, you may have seen, who is a Rangatahi Advisory panel member for the Aotearoa Circle, who unfortunately couldn't make it this evening. She's not feeling well. But I see already, Jill, well done. She's online. She's already submitted a question, which is fantastic, which is just a reminder for you all to get your questions onto Slido. You can upvote other people's questions, which I would encourage you to do. So with that, what I'm going to do is just navigate elegantly down to the floor. And as I do, there's a question that I wanted to pose to each of the participants. And David, I'm going to skip over you 'cause you've had the mic for a little bit. And I'm going to go to Faiesea, and then along the panel to share a few words about yourself, where you see the world. But the question I'd love you to address is that, you know, on a scale of zero to 10, zero being pretty poor, 10 being fantastic, how would you rate our local climate response in its in how well it takes into consideration principles of an equitable or just transition and why. So, what's your score, what's your rating for us? And why'd you give it that rate?

- All right, thank you. My name is Faiesea Ah Chee. I am a third year student studying a Bachelor of Arts and Global Studies at the University of Auckland. I major in Environments and Sustainable Development and Sociology. I am a member of Pacific Climate Warriors, Pacific Vision Aotearoa. And I'm also on the board of Auckland Climate Festival. I would say it's definitely not a 10, definitely not a nine, definitely not eight, a five. I think we've had a lot of conversations on climate change, but we have less actions. And yeah, a lot of conversations about it, less actions. I think it's about time we book actions, our words into actions, if that makes sense but yeah.

- Corbin's my name. I'm from Wato. So, I grew up in the small town and I come from a background in public health. I've had the privilege, the opportunity to work in the space of community health, Hauora Maori population health. And I think as part of that and in relation to our today around equitable transitions, I've also had the privilege to be involved in, you know, interfacing the space of , of climate and of environment and actually trying to put that into practise and into some applications within my roles in the public service. So hopefully as part of our today, I can contribute and provide some insights around that. But yeah, in response to that Alec, I'm going to go ahead and be a little bit boring and cut right down the middle and say five out of 10.

- [Alec] Two fives so far, right.

- Two fives make a 10. But I'd say similar to Faiesea, you know, we haven't been able to see the transmission of these plans. For example, the emission introductions plan, which is obviously still an esku. And I'd like to see these not only communicates it at those higher levels of policy and decision making, but actually how do we communicate not only the outcomes that we want to achieve, not only the goals and the standards, but how do we communicate the importance and the intention of these processes to everyone in and . And I think, you know, I actually see part of my mahi and looking at health and how health is going to be impacted by climate change, but not necessarily just the consequences for health of climate change and a climate crisis, but also the opportunities that a just transition presents. And through my mahi, you know, I've been able to actually explore a little bit of that and you know, that's happening across the sector, across the private sector as well. So yeah, five out of 10.

- [Alec] All right. Kia ora.

- [Alec] Josephine. Tena kotou katoa.

- I'm Josephine Bartley. I'm an Auckland councillor. I was elected from the Maungakiekie Tamaki Ward. I've been a councillor now for 5 years. It feels like 50 years. And before that, I was on the Maungakiekie Tamaki local board since 2010. Before that, I was working for Consumer Affairs for 14 years. So, my background is in law and really about fairness and social injustice I think is pretty much what my life is about. I acknowledge Alec for the invitation to be part of this panel. I don't ever get to be on a panel about climate action or climate change 'cause it's not, yeah, it's not my wheelhouse, I guess. But it's about community, so it is my wheelhouse. I acknowledge Auckland Conversations, Ashley and your team for putting this together and working with Alec, our counsellor here, Angela Dalton, who's the deputy chair of the Planning Environment and Parks Committee at Auckland Council and her strong leadership. And also apologies from the chair, Richard Hills, who was another strong fighter for climate action and the environment. Oh, the question, I'm a five as well. I think, you know, we, in 2019, 11, June, 2019, we declared a climate emergency at

Auckland Council and we have the Te Taruke-a-Tawhiri climate action plan. We have the targeted rate that's brought in quite a lot of money, billion dollars and most of it has gone into electrifying our bus fleet and getting bus services to some communities who don't have access. And Urban is in there along with our 21 community recycling centres and are very proud of the recycling centre in Onehunga, because that's the first one led by Maori and Pasifika communities and the Shoreline Adaptation Plans. So, we've come some way, but not fast enough. So, that's why I give it a five. But in terms of locally acknowledging what all of us are doing locally, we were doing stuff to do with the environment on our local board when I joined in 2010, but it wasn't classed as climate action, but it actually is. So yeah, I'll go with five. Thank you. Kia ora tatou.

- I'll say something that, something just introducing myself. I've got to say something different than the introduction. So, I was involved through our Mana Whenua Forum of Tamaki Makaurau, where 19 mana whenua sit together in co-partner of Auckland Council in developing Te Taruke-a-Tawhiri. And at that point and I guess the irony is the Te Taruke-a-Tawhiri was adopted when Auckland had a different water crisis. We're in the middle of a drought. So, it's ironic that few years later, we are now sitting in the context, we've had too much water this year. And so that work, and often I think where we landed in the trajectory and a lot of the work that has been done since, we were tracking towards the six, both in a local government and I think in a central government perspective. But in the last 18 months, we've slipped back to maybe a four and a half, five. And a lot of that is to do with a shift in political views and sort of being distracted by other things as opposed to what's facing our communities and the state of our environment and our people. So, we had a real hopeful six, we're tracking towards six and especially a lot of the actions and things that have come out of it, it's now sort of in our view, dropped in the pecking order with other things. And certainly, the challenges that many of our councillor have to face when they're supporting and advocating for our communities. And it's really apt that we're having this conversation in South Oakland because the other point, from a mana whenua perspective, whether it's climate change, poverty inequity, water crisises, flooding, it's all about wellbeing or oranga at the end of the day. And so, the opportunity really to come together around the wellbeing of our people, our communities, our environment. And I love that whakaaro that was shared earlier about, it's the care in "The Careful Revolution." And you know, and another sort of thing that's just popped up yesterday is when you get politicians making statements like, "Maori are not indigenous," you know. So, things that were given around climate change are now being questioned now and that's the problem. We circle back and question everything that should be givens now. And that becomes the uncareful revolution when we're not really caring. We are getting caught up in a lot of the political stuff and hype and especially now, we are heading into another election cycle. And that's part of why the Climate Festival was sort of located at this period because it's an opportunity for Auckland just to come together, have these sort of conversations, and it is about that climate action from a community-anchored, community-led perspective. Kia ora kotou

- So hey, a pretty, I actually think you are all being really somewhat generous, like fives and four and a half. I think where we are is quite interesting. There's a question in the group which I'll kind of throw out there, which kind of builds on David, your conversation, and

actually one of the things we wanted to cover was in terms of progress, in terms of what are we seeing that's good, what are we seeing in terms of positive action. Obviously very recently, we had MB and Motu do their just transition guide for communities. And I want you guys to hold that community view. The reason we wanted to pull this panel was that diversity of viewpoints. So, communities are not one thing. They're very diverse. And so, I guess a question to you, David, when we're thinking about careful, what is good and how do we bridge that multiple different voices into the conversation to recognise that often we don't have the, or we don't have that voice. How do we bring that voice out? So, things that have happened that you think you're really positive that bring that careful transition, careful revolution, and also the multiple voices that we have.

- Yeah, I think one of the key things is just listening and just hearing the sorts of challenges that communities are facing in regards to the transition. Because it's very hard for policy makers whether they're, you know, up the Auckland Council Tower building or whether they're in Wellington setting policy to actually truly understand where the pressure points are and where the sticking points are for people in regards to climate change policy. So, and a lot of the means by which to change people's behaviour and to drive climate action forward, you know, there're often price mechanisms there. There's sort of abstract rules and regulations. There's not necessarily that process of understanding how people are responding, how they're feeling about this. And often when the backlash builds, it's too late to stop that momentum. Hearing people's concerns and just even just acknowledging them is a really important step because if there's a shared understanding that, you know, those concerns are being heard and understood and listened to, then that even that can go some way to diffuse some of these tensions. But the next step, obviously, is to reconsider how policy's being done, how it's being pursued, and to, you know, adapt our processes accordingly. And yeah, what we talked about in this recent guide to community just transitions that was commissions by MB was really to take that community lens and to give communities the tools to articulate for themselves what their aspirations, where they see the sticking points, and where they might see some of the solutions because members of the community also are sometimes the holders of the expertise, the local knowledge, which actually helps to unlock some of these challenges. And so it's, you know, some of the problems I think in the way that climate policy has been done here is that it's tended to be taken in a very top down approach. And I think there's an opportunity to think more from the bottom up. Both are needed because communities don't necessarily have the resources that they need to realise their aspirations. So, they need that connectivity with the big levers of government and capital markets and so on. But we need to get that bottom up and top down working together.

- Yeah, can I bring Josephine, Faiesea? I'd love to get your perspective. So, Faiesea from the community, because a lot of the work that you are doing is with the community and trying to galvanise and talk through what is it, you know, how do we get our voice. So, I'd love to get your perspective on how that works or doesn't work in terms of getting that voice. What does the community that you are talking to need? And then, Josephine as well, if you can think about, you know, how do you bring that to that council table? And how do you help shape that understanding from a broad range around that table to try and get that view, but yeah. Faiesea.

- Right. I just want to acknowledge our Pasifika community tonight. A lot of the work that we do in the climate space is through our indigenous ways of storytelling, et cetera, et cetera. And I feel like with how we bring this into the table is there's a lot of inequality happening and I hate that. Ever since I started university, all my essays has been inequality, inequality. I try my very best to be positive, but it's everywhere I go, it's everywhere is inequality. And yeah, that also comes to like every time I try to bring up a conversation about climate change in our community, they have a lack of understanding about climate change. It's because what's happening in our community, they're trying to survive and they all have, we're all put into this category where like we're all working a lot on labour jobs. And every time we try to bring in conversations about climate change, it'd be like, "Okay, just go to school. Go be a doctor, don't bring this conversation about us. We don't believe in climate change." So, I feel like with inequality happening in this society, there's a lot of yeah, as Pasifika, we're really trying our very best to like to tackle this issue. Yeah.

- Yeah, absolutely back up what Faiesea was saying. Your question, Alec, about how you bring-

- [Alec] Bring the voice of the community.

- Bring the voice of the community to the table. How do you bring the voice of the community to the table? I think it really, yeah, you really, you can't go past the issues that are out there in the community and you'd be blind not to notice the inequality that's out there. You bring it to the table, but ideally, what is it? It's what what people find will get them votes to come back to that table to be honest. That's the reality. I mean, around the Auckland Council table, people are worried about how they will get back in. So, they will support things that are popular but may not be the things that we need to be facing as a city and yeah. Yeah.

- So, that's a bit bleak, right?

- Yeah, that's bleak.

- 'Cause I guess going back and maybe Johnnie, I can bring you in as well, 'cause this view and we saw this into Te Taruke-a-Tawhiri about those processes that we've historically had, and this is your top down, bottom up, right? That we have policy setting at the high level that has assumptions about how people want to engage. And then, you've got Faiesea, your contribution about actually what's happening on the ground. and Josephine, what you've seen. And this is what we heard Johnnie had particularly from those communities, Maori Pasifika with some fantastic knowledge and insights, but actually getting heard is really challenging. And how do we actually build those principles of equity, which requires us to think about different perspectives is key?

- Yeah, I think one of the key challenges is that our current, what I call our current square systems aren't fit for purpose today post-COVID 21st century. And it's almost like, you know, about maintaining power control. And so within that work, and certainly within a Pasifika and the Maori perspective is we are very values anchored and those sort of core values haven't changed over generations. So, we navigate by a set of givens, but often in a square western system, those things are always up for grabs. And that's a confusing, that creates confusion for many of our communities. And I think the other challenge of driving from a bottom up perspective 'cause is really about those connections across our communities. One of the key principles that the Mana Whenua Forum adopted was the whānaungatanga, the relationships, our whakapapa relationships with Pasifika across the Pacific 'cause that's part of our whakapapa too. And one of our concerns from a policy perspective, if it's that continuation of the current square top down approach, and we are hearing that label that around climate refugees and with the concerns of our whānau in Tuvalu, Tokelau Kiribati around sea rise. So, people are preparing for this influx of climate refugees. Whereas from our perspective, they're whānau from one part of our whakapapa that are going to come to stay in another part of the whakapapa. And this will represent the third key migration or shift of whakapapa over the last thousand years. So a thousand years ago, my ancestors got on voyaging canoes, came to Aotearoa. We arrived as Pasifika people and became Maori to this place, to this. Then post World War II, we saw another shift. Many of our whānau from the Pacific came to New Zealand for work and other opportunities. And we see those migration patterns within Aotearoa. A lot of our Cook Island whānau that ended up in the forestry in Tokoroa and other places across New Zealand. So, what this climate shift represents is like a third wave of movement from the Pacific to Aotearoa. But if we rely on the current policy settings and thinking that it'll be become like an immigration issue, not the opportunity to welcome whānau to another part of their whakapapa. And the opportunity is our Pasifika whānau that are living here together with mana whenua how do we prepare ourselves for that welcoming, for that ability. Because many of our refugee people have suffered in terms of coming into this place. Places like Waipareira are a Maori response to urban migration. You know, trying to make sense of these things and bringing the care into the careful revolution. You know, so there's a lot of existing practises and models that we can actually be drawing from and learning when we think about Aotearoa being a convergence of place in terms of part of those transition. And within Te Taruke-a-Tawhiri, one of the, we talked about two little shifts and three big shifts. The two little shifts was recalibrating, BAU, business as usual, around water, climate, wellbeing. You know, just focus on what are the fundamental goals. And then, the second small shift was really about preparing for transition. How do we prepare our communities for a shift, so that they're part of the shift, not the shift happening to them. And the reality of many of our whānau's are not even aware of things like climate change, because of being in survival mode. In my day job, I work for Oranga Tamariki And so, I face this on a daily basis of trying to keep our Tamariki safe, dealing with family harm, all those sort of things. And then, we want to talk about a just transition. I mean they just got to try transition their lives from that survival mode. So yeah, I think that that's a real opportunity around the shift that needs to occur in the system in order for us to then think about that careful transition, careful revolution. Kia ora.

- Can I just, before I want to come onto the health and wellbeing and bring you in Corbin. Before I do that, Councillor Bartley, I mean, one of the things that I think some of the audience may remember in both the COVID experience and the Auckland anniversary day flooding, you know, being out in the streets and I remember seeing clips of yourself other councillors, councillor Dalton and Hills and others being out there with the community through these big events. And I suppose there's one which is a very proactive, like how do we make sure that the interventions that we put in place. And there's some comments here about move to electrification, but what does that mean for folk who can't afford electric vehicles and so on. But then there's the the crisis response side of things. So when you were out there and you were helping these communities through this reality of climate change playing out, like what were you hearing? What was top of mind from those communities and how do we make sure that is, it sounds terrible, but not lost. How do we make sure that the responses that we build kind of recognises the role of the community in that?

- Yeah, I think what the vaccination, you know, how our whole city went into lockdown, the floods, I think what that showed was when community are leading the response, it's way better than anything that an agency or centralised organisation can do because they don't have those connections and it's not from the community. That's the only way to get mobilisation is when it's from the community. The other, I suppose, issue that came out of it was what do people value. Do they value the collective or the individual? And at Auckland Council, we weren't really involved in the vaccination rollout. It wasn't till a few of us councillors kept banging the table really and saying, you've got councillors here that are celebrating that their area has got a high vaccination rate. "Whoop-de-doo, we are fine. We don't have to worry about anything." But that's not how we operate. We don't operate in isolation based on map boundaries. People, you know, move throughout the city. So it was about if we're going to get through this lockdown as a city, we're going to have to look at the ones that are falling behind and everybody has to get in behind and get them, you know, get them to that level so that we can all move ahead as a city. So, it was a real change. And then council, you know, got involved, got behind the rollout and supported the specific targeting, which was our Maori and Pasifika communities. And that's the same communities that are identified to be the worst affected because they have fewer resources in climate emergencies. So, how do you prepare? Preparation isn't going to be about making sure they all have food parcels. 'cause food was the biggest issue. For a lot of people, it was food. But it's not about preparing a food pack and water bottles for three days. It's got to go even bigger than that. So, you know, do they have the infrastructure in our low income communities to be able to handle when the rain comes? I grew up in Mangere, it's never flooded. But these recent floods, it flooded. Never seen that in Mangere before. So, you know, even at that level, how are we preparing our communities to be, what is the word I heard, flood resilience. And now, I've been reading a lot of stuff from Dr. Teuila Percival that it's children that are the worst affected. The majority that have died in a lot of the climate action has been children or worst affected has been children and how are we preparing for that as a city, as a country, so yeah.

- Yeah, I think there's a critical piece here that you said earlier, which that reflects on where the mindset moving from a what's right for me to how do we move through this. But in order to do the we, we need to understand who that we is and the breadth of perspectives

and how we resonate, how that draws resonance. So, I'm somewhat right, but I wanted to bring in that whole order that health and wellbeing lens to it. And Corbin, I'm really keen to get your insights from . Obviously, we heard there's a whole bunch of other things going on in the back of our minds collectively that's not climate related and so on. Health almost is both the challenge and an opportunity. That the challenge being the health impacts associated with changing climate, but the opportunity is here is a lens that we can talk to that hopefully will help build that way, that broader understanding that actually this is good. To your point earlier, you know, climate action isn't all bad. There are some real positives in terms of health benefits. So, I guess from your perspective and that of water and also if you can fold it in some way. I know that you've done a dissertation recently on health, mental health, right, and the impacts of mental health. So really keen to get your sense on the opportunity for health, the intersection of climate and health to try and pull us all together in a way that understands that we need to move forward together.

- Yeah, I think absolutely. You hit it on the head. There's a number of opportunities we can see and we can prioritise. But I just want to double back actually and respond to your last question around community voice. How do we bring those voices to the table? How do we instil a bottom up approach? One thing I wanted to touch on is it's critically important that we don't demonise communities, we don't demonise identities. It's so polarised as it is, but has been for how however many years. And David, you sort of spoke briefly on the Groundswell movement, and I want to, I'm going to take this slow. I want to, one, I want to consider, you know, the identity of rural communities. And when we look at the Groundswell Movement, the powers at, the powers that are influencing that movement and what it represents I think clearly there is a concern, a self-interested concern in some sense, a community concern for the rural communities who are worried about their way of life, who are worried about what the transition might have and might impact on them. And it's critically important that we take those voices and we see the reality of the movement for what it is. And when we look, when we talk about a bottom up approach, Groundswell represents a bottom up approach in a sense. But then also we have to look at what actors are involved in that movement that are actually manipulating the constituency. And I look to the likes of the agricultural lobby. I look to the likes of the shareholders of conglomerates, Fonterra, for example. What influence do they have in terms of manipulating the rural communities and rural identities as well are critically important. When I think of rural identities, I don't just think of land owning farmers, I think of sharemilkers. I think of farm hands. I think of, you know, local Maori communities, rural communities, young Tama you know, who lives with Nan on the back blocks on Maori land, who has to walk through concrete rivers, you know, who has no access to these lands that are rural. And those are the communities that are represented in this Groundswell movement. And I wonder how are they being manipulated? How is their genuine concern being manipulated for what is essentially a profit seeking incentive? You know, when we look at the movement itself, when we look at the leadership itself. So, you know, Groundswell, it's bottom up, but at the same time, it's top down because there's that, the governance of the sector that it represents of the communities, that it represents agricultural lobbyists. They're actually the top down and they're manipulating what is essentially a genuine concern from rural communities. So hopefully, that made some sense. But to push back and to go back to your original patai around, you know, hauora, climate, environment. As I said in my introduction, I've been

privileged to have the opportunity to consider that in some programmes in my work. And, you know, the consequences of the climate crisis, we are well aware that there's an increase in severity and frequency of extreme weather events. We're aware that there's a global temperature rise. We're aware of the increase in vector-borne illnesses of ocean acidification. And all of these, you know, these consequences of climate, of the climate crisis are going to have an impact on, you know, the life supporting systems that humanity relies on, of course. But that's the deficit approach. You know, if we highlight and we focus on what's the impending doom, then, you know, that's a critical driver. We've seen behind climate anxiety. Why are people being, you know, why are young people having a lot of concerns around mental health and climate anxiety. You know, we've heard cases of young climate activists who are, and I myself, have sort of felt this pressure, you know, towards depression, suicidal ideation, whakamomori, you know. I work for Hapai Te Hauora. I work for the Oranga Hinengaro clinical team. And that's exactly one dimension of our mahi and the whakamomori suicide prevention space is actually, you know, what's the influence of climate change? What's the influence of a growing consciousness around, you know, the impending concerns of climate change. So if we can shift it to focusing on the health opportunities that a just transition presents, I think that's incredibly important. For me, I've had an opportunity, you know, to realise my own, you know, sort of empowerment, building resilience through communion with the natural environment, you know, through growing my own consciousness and awareness around, you know, the anthropogenic impact on our climate, on our environments. And, you know, I'll speak to a I guess a story and experience I've had myself, and that's specifically around diving, actually. So, you know, going free diving, and, you know, that's a, it's an activity. And I think the first time I ever had the opportunity to go for a dive, you know, I was in a relatively dark place, you know, in terms of my own mental health state. I was about, you know, 18 years old, and a mate of mine, he invited me to come for a dive with him, and I thought, "Oh, hang on, not sharks." Right away, I was just immediately concerned. And, you know, I went into the water and well, I didn't go into the water, we went into the water and we were preparing to dive. And a mate of ours, you know, he recited a karakia instantly. And I sort of thought, "Oh, hang on, you know? Okay, sweet. So, what's this about?" Yep, so the bro he did a karakia and they explained sort of what the karakia was about, what the process was about. And then, you know, we went for a dive and I was incredibly afraid, you know. I'd sort of been dealing with my own concerns and I, you know, wondering what was going to happen. Going into the water, immersing myself and what was, you know, one of the only really wild natural resources that we have in Aotearoa. You know, you can go for a hike in the bush, but it's on a trail, you know. There's so few places that are untouched in this country, but going into the ocean, which of course also has had its own impact, you know, from things like fishing and whatnot. And being immersed in what was the most natural environment I'd ever been in, communing with nature. You know, I think when I first got into the water, I was holding onto my mate, you know. I didn't, you know, I was like quite scared and sort of wondering, you know, what was going to happen. But then, you know, I saw a whai, a stingray swim pass, and immediately I thought, "Oh, hang on. Like, oh, that's pretty cool or what's going on?" You know, and then, you know, I sort of kept swimming in the coral reefs and I was able to have that sort of objective view that I hadn't had the exposure to before. My point being communion with nature, having those opportunities to connect with our natural environment, with , there's something within that. And this is just one example of the potential opportunities that we can exacerbate as we look towards the low cap in future, as

we look to land use transition, as we look to, you know, an equitable transition. There are many involved, there are many, and yeah, we can touch on that more, but I've spoken too long so.

- [Alec] No, no, no, it's great. So, there's a few things that I'd love us to pull out in there. One just talking about connectivity. So, I was lucky there's a panel discussions as part of the Climate Festival on climate anxiety last week. And very much that conversation of connectivity was critical, whether it's to planet or people, whatever, just finding connections to help flip that. And I think it's a really important part about how we individually respond and how we make sure we retain our wellbeing. The other thing, and we have political economist David Hall coming out here, just on your point about Groundswell, there's a really interesting thing here where groups like that and this is just the thesis, groups are trying to create voice because they're not heard. So, they congregate. And so this is the how do we create systems that don't require, that acknowledge individuals, like the different perspectives that we have without having to congregate and potentially having that message taken away or taken off in a funny direction and all those kind of things. And I think there are, there is many. And I'd encourage people to look into like, you know, how well function is our democratic system. Sorry, this is going on a slight tangent, but you know, how do we use different methods, more deliberative methods? And talking to Anne Bardsley recently at Koi Tu about the work that they're doing on VKT reduction. Actually, Councillor Dalton probably knows much about this. So, this is a really interesting point though, right? So, we've been talking earlier about communities, community voice, how do we amplify that or how do communities get their voice heard without having to be lost in amalgamation, right? How do we do that? And so, I don't know if anyone has an answer but-

- I can't be heard at the back?

- [Audience] No, you're talking that way.

- Okay, thank you. That's good to know. Thank you. So in terms of that kind of how do we bring that voice to from communities, I don't know, David, some of your reflections, I know it's a big topic. Before I dive into some questions here, which I've been trying to feed in through.

- Sure, I mean the dynamic talked about before, you know, corporate support of grass, and co-option of grassroots activities has a name, it's called astroturfing. And that was, you know, it's been done for decades in the U.S., which has a incredibly well-organized and very well-funded. I mean they, the oil and gas sector there, spends hundreds of millions of dollars a year on lobbying and so on. I mean I don't think, fortunately, we have that same level of pressure, but it's not to say that those sorts of things don't occur for sure. How we kind of preserve the integrity and the sincerity of those concerns, 'cause I agree, I mean, I have a rural background myself, grew up in North Canterbury on a sheep farm. So, you know, that's always checks my sense of reality on these issues. And I think, you know, people, you know, they really do have genuine concerns about their livelihoods with these sorts of changes you

know, and you have to kind of treat them as sincere to even start a coherent conversation. You know, there is a lot of interest in to how to redirect these energies into more fruitful ways. And a lot of people are interested in ideas of citizens assemblies. You know, many public's processes where a group of people which is somewhat representative of a community gets together to talk through the issues with support from experts and so on. And I know that through this community transitions process, actually I had the great fortune to meet Helmut Modlik of Ngati Toa and he's sort of experimenting with this down there with a, you know, which draws both on talano traditions from the Pacific, but also, you know, wananga from the Maori and those sort of western ideas of citizens assemblies as well. And yeah, so there's experiments of this nature going on. You know, the challenge again, and it comes back to this bottom up, top down dynamic is when a group like that comes to make their decisions and their recommendations, what happens then? Because if you look at the French example where Emmanuel Macron, you know, he responded to the des gilets jaunes by saying he would set up a new process and they set up a citizens assembly, the Citizens Convention on Climate. They went through a long process. It was incredibly well funded and Macron promised to take on the recommendations without any dilution. But when push came to shove, you know, he actually started saying, "Well, I can't treat this," his actual words were, "I can't treat this like the Koran, like a sacred text." And he started to drop down all of the recommendations until, you know, it had dwindled down to a few. And we've seen a version of this in Aotearoa through the Land and Water Forum where, you know, again, in the rural land use environment, a number of organisations got together to go through a multi-stakeholder process to come up with recommendations and the government chose not to go through with them. So, it is tricky because you need those dynamics working together. The crown often has the money and the regulatory power to put these recommendations into action. And it holds that power, that economic and regulatory power, it holds that power even and is very reluctant to give it, give that power away. But I think, you know, that's to Johnnie's point, you know, these institutions like the Crown, they're just not set up well for what we're going through now. They're incredibly fixed, robust, you know, immobile, inflexible institutions which struggle to change and to turn into tech and struggle also to share power and to decentralise some of the capability. But I think that is part of the revolution and part of the transition, which needs to occur 'cause it's not just in technology. It's also going to need to be a transition in the institutions that we rely on.

- I'm keen and hopefully we'll get there 'cause obviously there's another system, the health system that's going through a similar kind of transition to try and be both to Johnnie's with square and circle, you know, how do you pull these together. So, have a think on that 'cause I want to come back. But before I do, there's a really important point here about one, there's one thing to bring people into the room to be part of the conversation. There's another to see the effects of that. So Faiesea I know, you know, you've been in lots of rooms. You've been invited into lots of places. You went over to the C40 Summit. But from your perspective, like how does it feel when you are, which is great, you're included, but then maybe see that actually things don't really follow through in terms of action activity.

- All right, I would like to bring in one of the experiences, sorry, that I encountered when I was invited to represent Auckland at the C40 Conference in Argentina last year... Sorry, sorry. So, the C40 stands for cities, C, cities, and 40 cities who are in the organisation. It's an

international organisation where they focus on cities with a population of 1.3 billion. And Auckland was nowhere near that population. But the reason why we're under C40 is 'cause we're an innovative city. And during my experience in Buenos Aires, Argentina, no one really cared about New Zealand. The bigger your country is, the bigger people will praise you. And we were literally, the way I look at it, we were like, so there's a table, people sitting on the table and then we were on the menu. They were just like, "Okay, we want, okay, we don't want New Zealand, I don't want this. We don't want this. We don't want that." But what I'm trying to say was that I was sent there to represent Auckland and to represent, but when I arrived in Buenos Aires, Argentina, I wanted to represent me being Pasifika 'cause I've grown up and I was born and raised in Samoan. And to be in a space where there's no people like me, I was the only brown person representing Pasifika and everyone else were from the north. And I was the only south, the global south. It's like, you know what, I'm here, I'm Pasifika, I'm going to represent my Pasifika people. And they were giving me an opportunity to speak, to make a speech and talk about, you know, being a youth and what do I want to bring on the table, yappa yappa, yappa. I ask, I request, I was like, "I don't want to speak. I want to moderate a panel and I want to talk straight to the mayors." I was given the opportunities to moderate a panel and to talk more about green jobs and vulnerable communities. During my panel with four mayors, I asked them questions. So, what are you doing in your cities, like with the vulnerable communities? They had no idea what they were talking about. And it just makes me realise like damn, how crazy these people are. And an example of that was the mayor of London. The mayor of London, dude posted on Twitter, "It was really nice," with a photo of him and us," the youth, saying, "It was really great spending time with the youth." Dude saw us walking down the stairs, stop us, took a photo, and then swap off. And he posted on Twitter, "It was really nice to see, It was really nice to spend time with the youth." And I feel like what I've learned from my experience internationally was the fact that we're literally on the menu, not on the table. We really want that chair sitting there and be like, okay, this is what we're going through, but it's about time that we shift that back. Put us back on the sit, not on the menu, right, if that makes sense.

- Awesome. Well, not an awesome experience, but I think it's a really important part to think about how do we shift from, yes, we're talking about equitable transitions and yes, we recognise lots of voices, but we need to move beyond the tokenistic, you know, platitudes to actually get some real integrated action. Just to come back again. So, the challenge of systems that don't necessarily reflect this or in transient. So Corbin, I don't know, you know, from the, we are going through this really interesting process with Te Aka Whai Ora and the Maori Health Authority as well. And it's like, is that, I mean is that approach working and what are the challenges of that? Is that something we need to see more generally? If we are going to, and this is not necessarily a health question, but when we think about a climate response that needs to be more equitable, that we have structures of government that are quite rigid, is this a model that takes us forward?

- I mean, yeah, certainly as a public servant, I somewhat restricted in my opinion. But that said, I think, you know, when we look at the likes of Te Aka Whai Ora as a independent statutory entity at arms length from government, the impact and the outcomes that we are going to see from these changes aren't overnight. They're incredibly long-term focused. You know, the aspirations of devolving care, of devolving governance and authority over health

commissioning, you know, there's an establishment process and it's an inherently political issue. We've heard political perspectives and voices around, you know, the status of Te Aka Whai Ora. We've heard responses like the HMAC Report, which was scathing over the outcomes and the financial outcomes in particular. We are always considering dollars and cents as we move forward. One particular challenge I probably can share is around, you know, the outcomes of programmes. And I'll go back to how I mentioned, you know, the suicide prevention. An issue within suicide prevention is that it's incredibly difficult to measure the outcomes of a suicide prevention programme because the outcome is death. How do you measure the success of a suicide prevention programme? You know, qualitative data and qualitative whānau voice voice lived experience, these are all incredibly important as we attempt to quantify, you know, the benefits of an institution like Te Aka Whai Ora. Applying that to the climate issue, do I think that an independent statutory entity at arms length from government that holds government to account on climate sustainability might be the best structure? I'm not sure. Yeah.

- Thanks, Corbin. I mean, arguably we have one of those in the Climate Change Commission, so there are interesting recent developments in terms of how well they're being listened to or not so we have some answers. Right, I'm going to jump into some of these questions and hopefully you'll have seen, I've been kind of trying to weave a few of these themes in, but there's some really good ones, and I've lost it now, in terms of some questions here and some quick file ones. Jill, you've been fantastic. I'm just going to move quickly through, so agree or disagree. This is like a hot quick one. Aotearoa is getting better in the way that it treats migrant or minority communities. Agree or disagree?

- Disagree.

- Sorry.

- Aotearoa is getting better in the way it treats its communities. I've lost it now. It's communities. I think we, the migrant communities.

- I totally disagree.

- [Alec] Disagree. Corbin?

- Disagree.

- [Alec] Disagree.

- That's not even a disagree, agree kind of question. But of course, I disagree. Yeah.

- Yeah.

- [Alec] Johnnie.

- Disagree.

- Yeah, and the reason I point on that and I kind of was a pre, you know, a fairly loaded question, but to bring us back to Johnnie when you were talking about migration, and we have challenges right now in terms of acknowledging or reflecting the voices of the people here. Now we know that there, and David, you shared this really interesting graphic on LinkedIn with Cuban climate niches and just highlighted where people are or are not going to be able to live. And Aotearoa New Zealand was a nice green spot that is going to be the very welcoming or welcoming. It's going to be a very appealing place to be. So if we're already not very good and we're not really making any progress, how is that going to look as we have increasingly diverse communities? Quick question. "So, where do you encounter the biggest resistance for an equitable and just transition?" Thoughts?

- Where?

- [Alec] "Where do you encounter the biggest resistance for an equitable and just transition?" That's a difficult one.

- I'll try. My answer probably reflects the kinds of spaces that I move in, but I think everybody rhetorically agrees with the idea of a just and equitable transition. I mean it's hard to disagree with really. I think everybody mostly, apart from perhaps eco-fascist terrorists. You know, most people will be on board with that. The challenge is implementing it and, you know, having to make the recommitment of funding the, you know, redesign of policy and so on. I think I touched on the fact that, you know, a lot of our policy, especially at the central government level, is you know, uses economic instruments like the emissions trading scheme, which are inherently inequitable in the way that they put price signals on households. And, you know, they tend to have a regressive effect where low income households, which spend, you know, more money on things like fuel for cars as a proportion of their household spending, they carry more of that. And so, you know, unless policy makers are really going in and redesigning these things in order to neutralise or to counter those effects, then, you know, all of these, all of this hand waving around just and equitable transitions, it just, it's kind of like a form of gaslighting. There needs to be like much more robust commitments around how policy is done to really turn that into a reality.

- Any other thoughts on that where? No. Maybe if we frame it another way, and this just leads into one of the other questions. Thanks, Rebecca. We've heard one of those barriers is very much community's ability to move out of that survival mode. So if we want to take that and maybe, you know, thinking about those challenging conversations were talking about

with your other role, you know, how can we enable those communities to move out of that survival mode so they can be part of that just transition?

- I think there's two sort of opportunities. One which we don't really do well is, you know, we tend to look at our current state and look to the future options in the way of navigating or transforming. So, we are very future orientated, but in a real linear way. We are not looking to the wisdom of our past. So when we think about the state of many of our whānau and a state of survival, there was a time in our history when we were thriving, you know, so, but we've lost sight of that. And so often it's more that circular return to that state of thriving. And I think too that many of our whānau, our communities that while they're in survival mode, they're still resilient because they're still here. You know, that there's some real obvious sort of observations. And I think that the real opportunity sits in how do we change the conditions around the whānau, 'cause it's not about trying to get the whānau to change, it's the conditions around them, you know. And often, it's a strategy too that instead of, you know, trying to have that conversation on how you're going to change, it's actually about changing the conditions around people and communities. So, some of the work that's happening right now within the Puhinui, it's anchored in place. So, it's a real place anchored approach. And we've adopted a catchment approach 'cause it could have been either steam restoration project or a community development project. And either focuses on one element, not a holistic focus around Oranga wellbeing. And so the real sort of outcome, and this is a 50 year sort of project, you know. That could be what, three or four generations within the Maori whānau And so, catchment, locating to catchment brings and identifies a number of communities. And one of those things we're discovering within the Puhinui is that we can work over three generations. And some of the cool things that are happening is our upper catchment is where our more affluent people live. They tend to also be part of the Friends of the Puhinui and those sort of care groups, which are really awesome. But what we're seeing is a lot of our elderly people out on a mission, taking care of things. And if we can link them to our young people, we are starting to see three generations starting to come together. Because how do we tap into the wisdom of our old people alongside that excitement and exuberance of our young people? And this is something that when our young people were getting into the climate strikes. And we're doing our Te Taruke-a-Tawhiri work at the time. And we sat down with our young people, they said, oh, what was missing from their view was the elders. And so, being able to anchor them with the elders where, you know, 'cause our kids, they're the ones that are leading the way anyway, but the guidance and the wisdom that come from our elders. So being able to think about at least over three generations. I'm really lucky, I live in a four generational home. I've got mokopuna, my mum who's 83. So, challenging conversations that needed to happen in our house, because of those different generations. But at the end of the day, it's that focus on the wellbeing of our whānau and the roles that we can play together. And it's those sort of approaches I guess and how do we anchor to place catchments create a really good natural flow in terms of how communities that come together. And I know that the importance of being able to anchor to place as part of that solution 'cause what's good for the Puhinui may not be the same sort of thing. And I guess the other insight that we learned from COVID was a different understanding of scale and scaling. So often, we are looking for solutions that we can take. The scale was what we learned in COVID was the importance of our little bubbles, our little safety bubbles, like scales on the fish and how those little bubbles can come

together and connect and support in, you know, more smaller sort of economies and those sort of things. It's in some ways going old school in terms of how this country was and learning from those experience to how do we apply it within the 21st century as our communities continue to diversify. And I guess the last point on this is I really know when we made it when all our communities can engage in institutions using their own language. That's the real, to me, the where we've arrived in a place 'cause we sort of talk about New Zealand being multicultural. If you ask any of our whānau, can they engage in an institution using their language, we will have to conform to English or common language. And that's part of the issue around the system, around the lack of agility of these institutions to really connect to our communities. You know, and that's the real challenge going forward.

- Yeah, I think that's great. And one thing to know, I think this question of perspective and I think your four generational household is really interesting from a you get to know what each other's perspectives are quite as you said. Challenging conversations, but really important to get that perspective. There is another great question which kind of leads to that, which is, "How do we move from tinkering with the edges of the system to checking out the system founded on," it says here, "white supremacy, patriarchy, capitalism?" I'd add colonialism to that. I don't think we're going to be able to cover that in the next 10 minutes, but it hits that point about systems and structures that you talked about, you know, helping families or communities out. We need to recognise that system that sits around it. There is a question though, and you mentioned COVID and I'd be really interested from all your perspectives. So, there's a comment here and we have a broad view that the communication around COVID was good and successful. Do we think it was successful? And if it, was what can we learn from that climate response that we can help galvanise action at a broad scale? And the reason I say do we think it was successful is, was it successful for everyone?

- I think it was successful in the sense that it achieved behaviour change because you saw people who were disengaged from community, you know, very hard to get to communities, being engaged, being connected to, and you know, part of the whole COVID response. Whereas yeah, where, yeah, so I think... What was your question again? Oh, was it successful? Yeah, that's why I think it was successful because it achieved that behaviour change and it got into communities where people find very hard to connect, agencies traditionally find hard to engage with. I think it was also successful because it got the message through to people that it's going to affect you directly and your whānau and your future and your life and it's urgent. So, I think it was is it was successful in that respect. And I think there's lessons for climate action because people don't see it as an urgent, you know, issue for some. They're not connecting the flooding and the walkway that's on the coastal, you know, edge falling into the ocean and the rain and all that. They're not connecting that with climate action, I don't think. And so, they're not yeah, they're not, they're not engaging in this. And I think that the challenge is how do we show people that this is affecting your daily life directly because yeah, just people just aren't seeing the relevance.

- Yeah, and I think that, and importantly as well as how do we do that without, and relying is a terrible way of thinking about it. But obviously the extreme weather events that we saw and there was some polling done and post that there was an increase in like awareness and

urgency around it. But obviously, we don't want to just rely on significant storm events and people suffering as a result of that. So, there's a question of how do we escalate the urgency without just relying on the impacts of climate change, which arguably is too late, right? So, we're just rounding it out and I have one last question for the crew. Before I do that, thank you everyone for providing your comments. There are some great ones here and Parker I think you must be online. I can't see you in the room. Parker always has a great way... Oh no, he is there. Oh, he is running away. He's running away. There's a great way. He has a great way with word. And one of the comments, I just want to turn it into a comment is within the word emergency is to emerge. And so, how do we help our communities emerge out of their current state, which is a really lovely way of framing it. So, thanks Parker. But my last question, so we started this evening with the rating five, you know, zero to 10 of how our climate response is going generally, but obviously trying to feed that an equity comment in there or context in there. So quickly, as quick as we can, like what would take, what would it take to get to a 10? What do you think we need to do to get from where we were, which was middling, which I think was an optimistic view, to a 10?

- Any way to get to 10 would involve a lot of different things. So, I'll just focus on one thing though because it speaks to some of what we've talk, been talking about, especially in regards to institutional stuckness and that system inertia. I think one opportunity is using intermediaries organisations or groups which don't quite belong to the big public or private bureaucracies, which struggle to turn quick. But can kind of work between them and create partnerships which enable them to support change in some of the sorts of activities that they're unable to do themselves. And I think a really interesting example actually from the health sector is Whānau Ora order. As you know, working between whānau and some of those government agencies to just ease that, ease the activity and to help guide and improve outcomes. You know, we've been involved in the Aotearoa Circle which does a bit of that more in the climate and environmental space. I also think of Ara Ake, the energy innovation centre. You know, these sorts of entities and they can just sit between the big leviathans of public and private sector and to help, you know, create that space for them to innovate and to try new different things.

- I think for me speaking from a Pasifika perspective is more of like giving space, allowing us Pasifika people to know to be heard and to give our input into the climate change talanoa. Yeah.

- Securing adaptation and mitigation as a non-partisan issue. How do you do that? Well, there's a lot involved so I'll leave it there.

- It's that little thing.

- I think to get to a 10 it is definitely it's community-led, but everybody on the same page as to what the goal is and everybody understanding what the goal is. Because I think we can talk about, you know, the big picture. We can talk about what we're trying to achieve, but we lose people in the implementation. So if we are all understand what we're trying to do,

then people will take some ownership and they'll understand why their daily life is being disrupted by these cones that are blocking the road to put in a cycleway or to put in a bus lane or to put in proper curbing so people can walk places. I think that will really, really help bring my rating up to a 10. And the yeah, implementation, the community led. Pardon?

- Yeah, I said-

- [Panelist] That was for improvement.

- I want that 10. But also people knowing that what they're doing makes a difference and people feeling that what they're doing makes a difference in the big picture of things. Because a lot of the time, you know, you're like, "Okay, I'm being inconvenienced 'cause I'm going to catch a bus. I catch caught the bus here, going to catch the bus home and I want to know that my getting out of my car is contributing to climate action and making a difference for what we're trying to achieve." And I think people need to know that and they'll hopefully buy into it. Yeah.

- Yeah, I'm really hopeful and I think that's a real important thing that we need to acknowledge is about how do we reinvigorate a sense of hope amongst our people, amongst our communities 'cause we're being quite hammered through COVID and a whole lot of things. And hope is really important. My goal would be sort of aiming to get to a 15 only 'cause I'm an optimist and I believe. And I think too this is really part of understanding our history and past. So, you know, David mentioned, you know, since the industrial revolution, the agricultural revolution prior, so those are just phases of time. And so what we're in a five or 600 year industrial revolution? What we are sort of witnessing is the fraying of the edge of the square and because the current square systems under immense pressure. And what's been revealed on the frail edge of the square is nature. And the reality is either she's going to get rid of us 'cause we are no longer useful for her. You know, that's part of our reality. It's not us trying to save the world, it's the world really saving us if we shift. And I guess the, I don't know whether this is controversial, but we had a little glimpse, you know, through COVID and post-cyclone Gabriel what a Maori-led, Pasifika-led response looks like. And there was hope that could be the normal. If we were able to have a Maori Pasifika-led response anchored around wellbeing, we'll get to a 15. That's the, you know, that's really the, a hopeful message because from a Maori perspective, we've had almost 200 years of the current system. You know, an opportunity is hand the steering paddle over to Maori to tangata whenua and we'll steer our course for the benefit of everyone. And I think there's still that little bit of fear around what am I letting go of power in order for someone else, you know, this whole, what we've seen in the political debates at the moment, but we haven't given a go, you know? And that's what makes me hopeful in the next 200 years of we are 'cause we are a real young nation. We are like still at . You know, we're still at kindergarten. We're still learning to get to know each other as peoples, you know. And so, but certainly when we think about the impact of the square system of all of us as humans, we become disconnected and displaced from place, that sense of home. And I think that's the hopeful element of we all trying to find home or return to source. You know, and certainly

indigenous wisdom can play a key role in being able to sort of heal ourselves as well as if we heal each other in that sense, you know. We saw the hope of that within COVID for a little time. Then all the different voices started the me started to get in the way as opposed to the wes. And I guess the other key learning thing in that we saw the vaccination rates jump up within Maori and Pasifika when they shifted from agency-led to community-led. And what that's about is trust, who do our families trust. And that's the critical thing. If we can really look at who's going to help navigate us those in between, the in between us, between big institutions, 'cause I see them as navigators. They're the ones that navigate and influence space and certainly trust is at the heart of that 'cause I think we'll start to see that shift across our communities when we really see those that are coming to help navigate and support the people that we trust in our local communities and those sort of things. So, trust is a critical element. Kia ora Johnnie. I think that's a fabulous place to wrap up this evening's korero. Before I invite Councillor Dalton to come up and say a final note of thanks, two things just to throw out there. One, there was a question, "Do we have a formal Auckland Council's climate action plan?" We do, it is Te Taruke-a-Tawhiri. So if you don't know about it, go to climateakl.co.nz and check it out. Some of the things that Johnnie spoke about are woven in there. How well we've delivered on it is a different question, different answer. But there is the foundation point there. The second thing, just a bit of as I said right at the start, this has been week one of four around climate action activities, climate action events. So, please go check out some more aucklandclimatefestival.co.nz and really engage, open your minds, think more broadly about what this response looks like. Consider a lot of what we've discussed here about your views, your perspectives, and how we open it up to a brighter, broader range of voices and perspectives. So with that, I'd like to express my personal thanks for the guys here. It has been superb to have got you all together. I've really enjoyed the conversation and I really appreciate you all taking the time out to be part of this, and to Jill as well online. And thank you for jumping in and providing your thoughts. So, round of applause and I'd invite Councillor Dalton to come up and say a few words. Tena kotou katoa

- And thank you for coming out tonight and for those that are online as well. I just wanted to summarise a few thoughts that I had along the way or what I think I heard because some of this is going to be very helpful to take back to work. I'm the councillor for the Manurewa-Papakura Ward. So for those who are not from out this way, welcome to our Look, given the solid five out of 10, which I thought was very optimistic too actually, but we've got a ways to go. So, we need to move from talking about equitable transitions to actually purposefully delivering on them. And what we've heard tonight and noting and recognising that we are in challenging times from a cost of living perspective. But if we can continue to put these things off that we need to do, it's just going to become more expensive. But we must understand what we've heard tonight, that there's a lot of our people who are simply in survival mode and this is not on their radar. And the importance that we have in bringing community along with us and how do we do that and Josephine and Faiesea reflected on that. There's ways that we can do it. There is storytelling. This is about community-led, like we do in every other disaster we have. Once we get community-led, Maori-led, Pasifika-led, we do get our communities engaged, involved, and understanding. There's so little understanding of what needs to be achieved here for the future of our city and our country. Acknowledging that there is climate anxiety out there, particularly for our young people, and how we can try and turn that around into the

opportunities that we have for our future into something optimistic. But importantly as well, we must hold our politicians accountable. We must ensure that the policies that have been created to address climate change and climate action, that they aren't just gaslighting. I thought that was a very good, who said that? Was that you? That was you. I thought that was very good. I'm going to use that at work. We have policies that we agree to and then we choose for some reason not to fund them or to change our minds because it's not politically popular. We must do the right thing and not the politically popular thing, and Joe talked to that as well. So, citizens assemblies to get our families involved, uphold our responsibility to Tiriti. And if we can do all of those things, we'll be getting a long, a long way away to getting to a 10. So importantly, and it's been mentioned a few times, is what we did learn from COVID. We did learn about that community response, being able to get the people that we trust telling us what the problem is and how we can get to resolve that problem. It's got to be people that we trust. So look, I'd just like to finish by thanking you, Alec, for facilitating the session tonight. It was good to see you again. I'm impressed you knew what the website was for the Climate Action Plan just like that. David Hall, for your presentation and for being on the panel tonight. You have laid down the wero, the challenge for all of us that we must be careful with transformation and that we must take the people with us and we must be tika about that. I'd like to thank our panellists, Johnnie Freeland, that sat down there in the end, Johnnie Freeland, Josephine Bartley, Corbin Whanga, Faiesea Ah Chee, and back again to David. And thank you to the audience who are both in the room here and are joining us virtually. And I'd just like to remind you all about the next Auckland Conversations as part of the Auckland Climate Festival. It is going to be transporting us to a cooler future, which will be on Wednesday, the 20th of September. And the full details can be found on the Auckland Conversations website. So, thank you again and let's give everybody here a hand and yourselves a hand. I'm going to now ask Johnnie if he would close us in a karakia please.

- I just wanted to reinforce the acknowledgement from Councillor Dalton in acknowledging our panel, but most importantly, all of you who've made your way here and our whānau that have come online as well. Yeah, without you guys, it'll just be a conversation amongst ourselves and we could have had it at home on the couch. But yeah, just really wanted to acknowledge everyone that's made their way here and also to acknowledge our , our MIT for the beautiful venue we're in. And just wish everyone a safe journey home.